

Robert W. Quinn, Jr. Federal Government Affairs Vice President

Suite 1000 1120 20th Street NW Washington DC 20036 202 457 3851 FAX 202 457 2545

June 21, 2002

Ms. Marlene H. Dortch Secretary Federal Communications Commission 445 12th Street, SW, Room TWB-204 Washington, DC 20554

Re:

Application by Verizon-New Jersey Inc. for Authorization to Provide In-Region, InterLATA Services in the State of New Jersey, Docket 02-67

Dear Ms. Dortch:

In a supplemental response to AT&T's Motion For Emergency Relief in this proceeding that Verizon filed last night, Verizon makes the extraordinary argument that its New Jersey application should not be denied, because its many violations of the Act could have been even worse. Verizon contends that if it "had wished to 'market aggressively its long distance services' in New Jersey, it[] . . . would have run systematic, high-visibility advertisements in various media telling all New Jersey residents" about those long distance services. It is now clear that Verizon did (and continues to do) just that.

This letter, the attached declaration of Mary Wojchik, and the attached streaming video file of a Verizon advertisement that aired on a New Jersey cable channel on Wednesday, June 19 provide yet additional evidence of Verizon's unlawful – and apparently still ongoing – long distance campaign in New Jersey. Even before this latest development, it was quite clear that Verizon planned and orchestrated a comprehensive multi-channel long distance marketing campaign that was intentionally scheduled to, and actually did, commence well before completion of the Commission's statutory review Verizon's Section 271 application. Moreover, and more important, it is now clear that the efforts by AT&T and others to bring this misconduct to the Commission's attention have not, as Verizon claims, caused Verizon to come clean and put a stop to its unlawful activities, and there is thus no basis to conclude that Verizon can or will

¹ See Verizon's Supplemental Response to AT&T's Reply in Support of Motion for Emergency Relief (filed June 20, 2002) at 1. Although AT&T does not doubt that there could have been more and even worse violations, the violations that have already been revealed (including billing inserts, direct mailings, and telemarketing) alone constitute "aggressive" marketing by Verizon of the long distance service it is not authorized to provide.

unilaterally cease its flagrant disregard of the law. To the contrary, swift Commission action is now necessary to redress Verizon's ongoing violations and convince Verizon to comply with the core requirements of the 1996 Act in the future.²

In particular, it is now manifest that, in addition to the bases demonstrated by AT&T and other opponents for finding that Verizon has not met the statutory requirements for long distance authority in New Jersey, Verizon's current misconduct independently forecloses the affirmative findings needed to grant Verizon's application. There can be no serious dispute that Verizon's ongoing multifaceted marketing activities violate Section 271, a fact that should in and of itself preclude a finding of Section 271 compliance. Further, Verizon's apparent intention to launch a coordinated unlawful marketing assault timed to "jump the gun" on the Commission's review of its Section 271 application raises serious questions about whether Verizon has complied with the requirements of Section 272 that its long distance affiliate not obtain improper or discriminatory advantage from its monopoly parent. There certainly could be no sustainable finding by the Commission on this record that "the requested authorization will be carried out in accordance with the requirements of 272." 47 U.S.C. § 271(d)(3)(B). At a minimum, the Commission must investigate whether the unlawful Verizon marketing activities are the result of improper marketing, financial or strategic "direction" provided by Verizon to its long distance affiliate. Finally, there is simply no sustainable basis for the Commission to find that granting Verizon's application is in the "public interest," as Section 271 plainly requires, in the face of these flagrant, ongoing, and apparently unrepented violations. The Commission must take these issues into account in considering and, AT&T submits, rejecting the New Jersey application.

Ms. Wojchik, a marketing employee in AT&T's Consumer Services division, resides in Bedminster, New Jersey and purchases cable service from Cablevision of Raritan Valley, New Jersey. See June 20, 2002 Declaration of Mary Wojchik at \P 1, 3. On Wednesday evening, June 19, Ms. Wojchik viewed (and taped) a Verizon advertisement aired on the "New Jersey News 12" channel carried by Cablevision. Id. at \P 4. In that advertisement (an electronic copy of which is attached hereto), the Verizon spokesperson urges viewers – and New Jersey News 12 is apparently carried only in New Jersey – to "ask about our low long distance rate" as the screen flashes "All on one bill" and provides the toll-free Verizon number. Later in the advertisement, additional text appears: "Save on long distance," "8 ¢ a minute." The ad also makes clear that the advertised long distance service is "provided by Verizon Long Distance." Although "where available" appears at the bottom of the screen, Verizon Long Distance service cannot, of course, lawfully be available anywhere in New Jersey.

New Jersey News 12 is produced by News 12 Networks, which is owned and managed by Rainbow Media Holdings, Inc., a subsidiary of Cablevision. Each of the News 12 Networks

² Indeed, the attached Verizon e-mail apparently distributed to the press by Verizon's Vice President for Media Relations suggests that the discovery of its violations is all a big joke to Verizon – Verizon there characterizes AT&T's very serious (and well documented) allegations as "silliness" and "fraternity pranks."

³ Ms. Wojchik was prepared to tape the advertisement, because on Saturday, June 15, 2002, she saw another Verizon cable advertisement offering long distance service and, as a member of the AT&T Consumer marketing team, was well aware that Verizon did not have authority to offer long distance service in New Jersey. Wojchik Declaration at ¶ 3.

(New Jersey, the Bronx, Westchester, Connecticut, and Long Island) provides local news tailored to the particular market. *See* http://www.rainbow-media.com/about/index.html; http://www.rainbow-media.com/regbus/news12.htmlwww. news12.com. New Jersey News 12, by far the largest of the News 12 channels, is distributed on Cablevision's New Jersey cable systems to more than 1.7 million subscribers (more than all of the other News 12 Networks combined). As stated in documents obtained from News 12 sales by AT&T's media buyers, advertisers may selectively purchase advertising spots on individual News 12 networks. Thus, the fact that Ms. Wojchik saw the Verizon long distance advertisement in New Jersey on New Jersey News 12 demonstrates that Verizon affirmatively chose to include New Jersey News 12 in its ad buy, notwithstanding that Verizon lacks authority to provide that service in New Jersey. That is fully consistent with Verizon's conceded instructions to vendors associated with its other marketing channels to market Verizon's long distance service in New Jersey, and it confirms yet again that the Commission must act now and that Verizon's New Jersey application should be suspended or denied pending a full Commission investigation.

For the foregoing reasons and those stated in AT&T's prior submission, AT&T respectfully requests that the Commission deny Verizon's New Jersey application (or, alternatively, suspend consideration of the application pending an investigation). If, however, the Commission grants the application, AT&T respectfully requests that the Commission stay the effectiveness of the Order pending appellate review.

One electronic copy of this Notice is being submitted to the Secretary of the FCC in accordance with Section 1.1206 of the Commission's rules.

Sincerely,
Robert W. Brunn J.

Robert W. Quinn, Jr.

cc: Dorothy Attwood
Kyle Dixon
Bryan Tramont
Sam Feder
Jordan Goldstein
Brent Olsen
Alexis Johns

⁴ The documents obtained from News 12 sales are attached hereto. *See also* http://www.rainbow-media.com/adsales/news12_sales.html ("News 12 sales represents each channel's local inventory, as well as selling them together as a 'ring' around the NY market").

Affidavit of Mary Wojchik

- I, Mary Wojchik, being duly sworn according to law, depose and say that:
- I am a resident of New Jersey. My home is located at 1 Harrow Lane, Bedminster, New Jersey 07921. I am a Staff Manager for AT&T Consumer Services with AT&T Corp.
- 2. The matters stated in this Affidavit are of my own personal knowledge and, if called upon to do so, I could and would competently testify to each of them.
- 3. On Saturday, June 15, 2002, I was at home watching television on my local cable system, which is Cablevision of Raritan Valley, New Jersey. At that time, I saw a Verizon television ad offering long distance service. To the best of my recollection, I saw the ad on New Jersey News 12, which is a New Jersey-only cable station. As a member of the AT&T Consumer marketing team, I was well aware that Verizon did not have authority to offer long distance service in New Jersey. Consequently, I was surprised to see the Verizon ad on a New Jersey-only station.
- 4. On Wednesday, June 19, at approximately 8.00 pm, I used my home VCR recorder to tape another Verizon television ad on New Jersey News 12 carried by Cablevision of Raritan Valley, New Jersey. During the ad, the following words are heard:

"At Verizon we wanna make staying in touch easier and more affordable for everyone. With our local package you can save on all the things you need to communicate. It's unlimited local calling together with our most popular services like caller id, call waiting and three-way calling. So you

have everything you need whether you're avoiding interruptions, getting every call or talking with two friends at once and it all comes on one bill for one low monthly rate. Call 1-800-298-5843 for great savings and unlimited local calls and ask about our low long distance rate too.

Altogether you'll see how the savings really add up. Have some of these services? You can still save. Call 1-800-298-5843 and save with our local package. Because we see the value of togetherness and what that means to you."

5. During the ad, the following text appears on-screen:

"Verizon Local Package
Not all services available in all areas
1 800 298-5843

Unlimited Local Calling

Not all services available in all areas

1 800 298-5843

Caller Id

Call Waiting

Three-way calling and more

Standard taxes and service charges apply

1 800 298-5843

Limited Interruptions

1 800 298-5843

1 800 298-5843

Keep in touch

Get everyone together

1 800 298-5843

All on one bill

1 800 298-5843

Great Savings

Savings based on bundling of all services

vs. purchasing separately

1 800 298-5843

Save on long distance

8¢ a minute

Service provided by Verizon Long Distance

where available.

1 800 298-5843

Caller Id

Call Waiting

Three-way calling

1 800 298-5843

Verizon Local Package

Great Savings

1 800 298-5843

Verizon

Make Progress Everyday

1 800 298-5843."

I declare under penalty of perjury pursuant to the laws of the United States of America that the foregoing is true and correct. Executed in Basking Ridge, New Jersey on June 20, 2002.

Mary Waphili
Mary Wojchik

Sworn to and subscribed to before me this 14 day of June 2002

A Notary Public of the State of New Jersey

Den 1

THERESA DONATIELLO
NOTARY PUBLIC OF NEW JERSEY
My Commission Expires November 9, 2004

---- Original Message ----

From: Eric Rabe <eric.rabe@clsdc.com>

At: 6/20 9:32

NOTE: Please disregard previous "Verizon Update." Corrected version follows.

Summer officially begins on June 21st with the Solstice, but at AT&T, the silly season is already underway.

Over the last week or so, in a series of trigger happy regulatory filings, the

long distance company that may be the shortest for this world, has accused

Verizon of everything short of being responsible for global warming.

In one case, the company's lawyers filed a complaint based on the alleged

experience of a single customer in New Jersey. The customer turns out to be an

AT&T employee. In another case, the AT&T gripe is based on a single letter to a small business.

This series of breathless anecdotes is supposed to support AT&T's demand (yet

again!) that the ban preventing New Jersey customers from getting Verizon long

distance service be extended a while longer. Nonsense.

The facts are clear. The New Jersey market is wide open to competition. All the

systems have been proven to work beyond any doubt during years of independent

testing. Competitors are in the marketplace. Even AT&T is no longer arguing

that the case has not been made.

So let's end the fraternity pranks. Meet us in the marketplace. We are glad to meet you there. But please AT&T, give up on this silliness.

Any thoughts or questions, please give me a call or drop me a line.

Eric Rabe VP, Media Relations, Verizon 215-963-6531



fortunoff

ON

NEWS 12

1/15/2002

COVERAGE: 3.3 MILLION HOMES

FLIGHT: MAX EVENT MARCH -3 WEEKS

			•	DIVIA
DAYPART	FREQUENCY	:30	TOTAL	A25-54
M-F 5:30a-9a	3 X	\$625	\$1,875	0.83
M-F 9a-5p	<i>3</i> X	nc		0.3
M-F 6p-12a	<u>3</u> X	<i>\$525</i>	\$1,575	0.72
TOTAL	9 X	COST	\$3.450	





NEWS 12

COVERAGE: 3.3 MILLION HOMES

<u>NEWS 12 NEW JERSY 1,770,000 HOMES</u>

Bergen

Passaic

Sussex

Moris

Essex

Hudson

Union

Warren

Hunterton

Somerset

Middlesex

Mercer

Momouth

Ocean

NEWS 12 LONG ISLAND 800,000 HOMES

Nassua

Suffolk

NEWS 12 WESTCHESTER, NY 270,000 HOMES

<u>NEWS 12 BRONX</u> <u>260,000</u> <u>HOMES</u>

NEWS 12 FAIRFIELD, CT 200,000 HOMES

All zones are independent and can be purchased that way.





DMA

fortunoff

ON

NEWS 12

1/15/2002

COVERAGE: 3.3 MILLION HOMES

FLIGHT: outdoor furniture MARCH -15 weeks

				D IVI/
DAYPART	FREQUENCY	<u>:30</u>	TOTAL	A25-54
M-F 5:30a-9a	5 X	\$625	\$3,125	0.83
M-F 9a-5p	<i>5</i> X	nc		0.3
M-F 6p-12a	<i>5</i> X	<i>\$525</i>	\$2,625	0.72
TOTAL	15 X	COST	T \$5.750	





3,341,000 HOMES

<u>News 12 New Jersey</u> <u>1,771,</u>

1,771,000 HOMES

News 12 Long Island

Riverhead

Huntington

Hauppauge

Babylon

Brookhaven

Oyster Bay

Hempstead

805,000 HOMES

Paterson

Wayne

Edison

Bayonne

Cresskill

Newark

Toms River

Manahawken

Bridgewater

Dover Elizabeth

Wall Township

Freehold

Seaside Heights

Hoboken

Port Murray

East orange

Eatontown

Hightstown

Jersey City

Lyndhurst

Plainfield

Point Pleasant

Union

Woodbridge

Long Beach

Sparta.

Palisades Park

Mamaroneck

Port Chester

Yonkers

Yorktown Heights

News 12 Westchester

Ossining

275,000 HOMES

News12 Connecticut

Bridgeport

Fairfield

220,000 HOMES

News 12 Bronx

270,000 HOMES